

TCE paper review guidelines for Reviewers

- To start with, a reviewer should examine whether the paper content is out of the scope of TCE. Reject the paper immediately if it is out of scope.
- If the review decision is “MINOR” or “ACCEPT” in the **1st review process** of a manuscript, reviewers and/or the corresponding AE must give strong justifications.
- The comments given by a reviewer should be commensurate with the decision given, e.g. the comments are critical such as wrong concept and/or without novelty but the decision is minor. Try your best to avoid similar conflicting comment-decision.
- If there are already two rounds of “Major” decision, in normal case, the 3rd round of review should normally be either minor/accept or reject & resubmit. “Reject” should only be issued when dishonesty, plagiarism, or similar serious challenge is encountered. Please report it to the corresponding AE/SE and EiC if suspicious plagiarism or any form of dishonesty is detected.
- Be mindful about the *abnormal* progress of comments from “Major” to “Reject & re-submit” or from “Minor” to “Major”, please provide strong justifications for such cases. It’s the obligation of AE/SE/EiC to help authors to excel and publish in TCE. AE is highly encouraged to give a simple overall comment, whenever possible and applicable, to help authors to improve the paper quality for publication purpose.
- Note that IEEE explicitly forbids self-cite coercing.
- Reviewers should fill in comments in the “Comments to the authors” block but not elsewhere. Otherwise, the comments will not be shown to the authors. Once accepted the paper review invitation, reviewers are deemed to delegate the right to TCE to copy the comments to authors in the extreme case that a reviewer has made entry to the incorrect review comment block.
- A reviewer will be asked whether you would like to review the revised version of the manuscript (select "Yes" or "No" in the reply form). Reviewers are strongly encouraged to tick “Yes” for the benefit of a fair review as well as sustainability purpose.
- A certificate will be issued to reviewers who perform quality and speedy review. The *Best Reviewer Award* will be announced towards the end of year. Additional weightings will be allocated to quality reviewers if they will apply for Special Section and Guest Editor/Associate Editor position in TCE.